

Making Decisions

17-313 Fall 2022 Michael Hilton



Life is all about tradeoffs

In this course, we have talked a lot about tradeoffs.

Some tradeoffs we have discussed:

Writing Tests vs writing more features

Choosing a familiar tech stack vs a "trendy one"

Other tradeoffs...?



Think about structured ways to make decisions

Do what is ethical, legal, moral, obvious

Sometimes, there are multiple (legitimate) options, that all seem to have positives and negatives.

What to do?



People have studied this before...

Economics

Biology + Microbiology

Sociology

Engineering

Computer Science

Strategy Games

Ethics

Medicine

Politics



Architecture Tradeoff Analysis Method

- 1. Present the ATAM.
- 2. Present business drivers.
- 3. Present architecture.
- 4. Identify architectural approaches.
- 5. Generate quality attribute utility tree.
- 6. Analyze architectural approaches.
- 7. Brainstorm and prioritize scenarios.
- 8. Analyze architectural approaches.
- 9. Present results.

https://concisesoftware.com/architecture-tradeoff-analysis-method-atam/



🔁 S3D

Pros and cons

THE PROS & CONS of MAKING A PROS & CONS LIST PROS CONS LISTS ARE FUN! CLEVER WAY .3 of RATINALIZING P MAKES YOU Appear A BAD DECKION THOUGHT ful f DELIBFRATE GREAT PRACTICE AT DRAWING STRAIGHT LINES -THE OATHERL

https://theoatmeal.com/blog/pros_cons_list

S3D

Moral or Prudential Algebra

1. Make a list of Pros and Cons

2. Take a few days to think, forcing your brain to come up with all of the positive and negative aspects of taking the measure you're considering.

3. Assign weights to each item on your list depending on its importance.

4. When the weight of a item on your "pro" list is equal to the weight of an item on your "con" list, strike both of them out.5. What is left in the balance is the choice you need to make.Wait a few more days and, if nothing new occurs to you, act on the decision you've made.





Even Swaps

Premise:

It is easy to make decisions when there is only one objective.

But having only one objective, as any decision maker knows, is a rare luxury.

Even swaps provides a practical way of making trade-offs among any set of objectives across a range of alternatives.

THE POLITIES OF E- MAIL	to to	405 N 204
Harvar	d Business Revie	ew
8	MARCH-AR	11. 1999
	8 10 31	E
anticipus M. closed and and ethnic I. Incluse	THE ALCHO	
utologe R. slowersen et diami i locari con magnetis	THE NACES CONSISTER IN MARKETS THAT WORKT STAND STILL THE DOWNER OF VIETNAL RATION ATION AN EPTEMPERT WITH DOLL CONFERENCE INCOME. DOLL	() 12
urbiten R. disectorit et d'Alas I. Index on Reports Induct I. Salar, Achtel J. Jose, et d'Anar in orbit.	THE ALCOHO COMMENTE IN MARCET THAT WON'T STAND STILL THE INTERNET IN THE DOLE COMMENTS I MICHAEL DOLL AN INTERNET INTO DOLE COMMENTS I MICHAEL DOLL INTERNET INTO INAL CARLOS AND IN MICHAEL INTO INAL CARLOS AND IN	1+ 72 84
urbleve IX, slowitariti Al (1964) 1 Josén des Region Ta Martin D. Dollar, michael J. Sanger D. Dollar, michael des rescons managest diport held servers	THE INCOME IN MARKING THAT WORK I STAND STILL THE INCOME AN A VIETLAL PATTOCK MOME AN INTERVIEW WITH DUEL COMPATING MICHAEL DEL INTERVIEW INTO DUEL DEL INTERVIEW INTO DUEL DEL INTERVIEW INTO D	14 72 86
unidore R. downsett debut I. base can majarette influet I. baster motion p. down, etci Scenar en ordet depo teccio mangoni etd juer tecla bastere oragin I. basteriore, jo.	THE RECEIPTER OF SALES OF CONTRACTOR	10 72 84 891
urbiner K. disensert Mitthia I. Leiten on mejerts hint I. Leiter Mithaerj, fan, erk tener in onlet egeneren meter disen het konsen onges I. hetensen je	THE RECEIPTER OF BALLARD CONTACT TO A CONTACT OF A CONTAC	19 72 16 191 194
ortificer IX disenserP Al distant I. Indee on magnetic statut I. Indee Million and Antonio and Al Second Statut I. Indee Million and Antonio Al Jose Statut I. Indee Million and Antonio Million and Antonio Million and Antonio	THE NAME OF AN ADDRESS OF A DESCRIPTION	10 12 10 10 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11
unition R. downerst en magerin om magerin infact I. Index Automation infact I. Index Automation infact for former and the formation memory origin I. Index Con Status Confect Status Confect Mag Society (20 Free Status	THE ACCOUNT OF A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A	10 12 13 14 134 14 14
unitatione III, alianeta eri ant ething II, bester com magnetita mittari II, bester mattari II, denn, end kannet mittari ething best helden bester erigi best helden bester.	THE ALCON THE ALCON THE DESIGN IN MARKET THAT WENT STAND STILL THE DESIGN IN WITH ALCONDUCTION AN OTHER THE DATA CONTACT THAT WENT STAND STILL THE DESIGN IN THE OWNER OF THE DATA OF THE DESIGN THE DESIGN IN THE OWNER OF THE DATA OF THE DESIGN THE DESIGN IN THE OWNER OF THE DATA OF THE DESIGN IN THE DESIGN IN THE OWNER OF THE DATA OF THE DESIGN IN THE DESIGN IN THE DESIGN AND ADDRESS IN THE DESIGN IN THE DESIGN IN THE DESIGN AND ADDRESS IN THE DESIGN IN THE DESIGN IN THE DESIGN AND ADDRESS IN THE DESIGN IN THE DESIGN IN THE DESIGN AND ADDRESS IN THE DESIGN IN THE DESIGN IN THE DESIGN ADDRESS IN THE DESIGN IN THE DESIGN IN THE DESIGN ADDRESS IN THE DESIGN	10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10



Overview - 3 step process

1. Create a Consequences Table

2. Eliminate "Dominated" Alternatives

3. Make Even Swaps



Running Example from research paper

Example: Alan Miller is a computer scientist who started a technical consulting practice three years ago.

For the first year, he worked out of his home, but as his business grew he decided to sign a two-year lease on some space in the Pierpoint office park.

Now that lease is about to expire. He needs to decide whether to renew it or move to a new location.



Define the objectives

Alan defines five overriding objectives that he needs his office to fulfill:

- 1. a short commute from home
- 2. good access to his clients
- 3. good office services (clerical assistance, copiers and fax machines, and mail service)
- 4. sufficient space
- 5. low costs

He finds five viable alternatives: Parkway, Lombard, Baranov, Montana, and his current building, the Pierpoint.



Create Consequences Table

Objectives	Parkway	Lombard	Baranov	Montana	Pierpoint
Commute in Minutes	45	25	20	25	30
Customer Access (%)	50	80	70	85	75
Office Services	А	В	С	А	С
Office Size (Square Feet)	800	700	500	950	700
Monthly Cost (\$)	1850	1700	1500	1900	1750

https://hbr.org/1998/03/even-swaps-a-rational-method-for-making-trade-offs



Create Ranking Table

Objectives	Parkway	Lombard	Baranov	Montana	Pierpoint
Commute in Minutes	45 (5th)	25 (2nd tie)	20 (1st)	25 (2nd tie)	30 (4th)
Customer Access (%)	50 (5th)	80 (2nd)	70 (4th)	85 (1st)	75 (3rd)
Office Services	A (1st tie)	B (3rd)	C (4th tie)	A (1st tie)	C (4th tie)
Office Size (Square Feet)	800 (2nd)	700 (3rd tie)	500 (5th)	950 (1st)	700 (3rd tie)
Monthly Cost (\$)	1850 (4th)	1700 (2nd)	1500 (1st)	1900 (5th)	1750 (3rd)

https://hbr.org/1998/03/even-swaps-a-rational-method-for-making-trade-offs



Eliminate "Dominated" Alternatives

Objectives	Parkway	Lombard	Baranov	Montana	Pierpoint
Commute in Minutes	45 (5th)	25 (2nd tie)	20 (1st)	25 (2nd tie)	30 (4th)
Customer Access (%)	50 (5th)	80 (2nd)	70 (4th)	85 (1st)	75 (3rd)
Office Services	A (1st tie)	B (3rd)	C (4th tie)	A (1st tie)	C (4tn tie)
Office Size (Square Feet)	800 (2nd)	700 (3rd tie)	500 (5th)	950 (1st)	700 (3rd tie)
Monthly Cost (\$)	1850	1700	1500	1900	1750

https://hbr.org/1998/03/even-swaps-a-rational-method-for-making-trade-offs



Make Even Swaps

- 1. Determine the change necessary to cancel out an objective.
- 2. Assess what change in another objective would compensate for the needed change.
- 3. Make the even swap.
- 4. Cancel out the now-irrelevant objective.
- 5. Select the dominant alternative.



First Even Swaps

• For Baranov, swap 5 commute minutes, for 8% customer access.

Objectives	Lombard	Baranov	Montana
Commute in Minutes	- 25 (1st tie)	20 25 (1st tie)	25 (1st tie)
Customer Access (%)	80	70 78	85
Office Services	В	С	А
Office Size (Square Feet)	700	500	950
Monthly Cost (\$)	1700	1500	1900



Second Even Swaps

• For Baranov, swap C->B, add \$200, for Montana, swap A->B, reduce \$100





Second Even Swaps

• For Lombard, swap 250 sq ft for \$250





Advice for swaps

- Make the easier swaps first
- Concentrate on the amount of the swap, not on the apparent importance of the overall objective.
- Remember that the value of an incremental change depends on what you start with.
- Make consistent swaps.
- Seek out solid information.

